



California Advisory Committee (CAC) on Salmon and Steelhead Trout
Meeting Agenda
Thursday, January 21 10:00 AM – 4:30 PM

NOTICE: The CAC is conducting this meeting by Microsoft Teams and teleconference to avoid a public gathering and protect public health during the COVID-19 pandemic, consistent with Executive Orders N-33-20 and N-29-20

[Microsoft Team Meeting Link](#)

Microsoft Teams can accommodate audio and video functions with capable computer/mobile devices

If unable to connect via computer or if audio is not working use the following:

Conference Phone: 1-916-535-0984
ID #: 571 816 481#

AGENDA¹

10:00 – 10:30

- Welcome, Introductions, and Establish Quorum
- Opening Comments by CAC Members and CDFW
- Public Comment¹

10:30 - 11:00 - Ongoing Business

- Review Action Items from October 2020 Meeting
- CAC Membership and Peer Review Committee (PRC) Nominations
- PRC and Steelhead Committee Updates
 - Matt Clifford, Gayland Taylor – CAC members
- Future CAC Meeting Agenda Items

11:00 - 12:15 - Agenda Item #1:

- Briefing on Thiamine Deficiency in Hatchery Salmonids
 - Rachel Johnson, Charlotte Ambrose - NMFS

12:15 - 13:15 – Lunch

13:15 - 14:15 - Agenda Item #2:

- Update on the Klamath Dam Removal Status and Timeline
 - Brian Johnson - Trout Unlimited; Joe Croteau – CDFW



14:15 - 15:30 - Agenda Item #3:

- CAC Member Round Robin Updates: (~5 mins per update)
 - Matt Clifford - TU Legislation (in development with CDFW) regarding landowner legal liability for voluntary restoration on private property
 - Dr. Ted Grantham - Brief update on the California Environmental Flows Framework
 - Jeanette Howard - Update on SWRCB+UC Davis CA WAP Analyses
 - John Koeppen –
 - Continued discussion on the whiting mothership sector's effort to gain access to CA waters
 - Update on the Southern Oregon/Northern CA Coho ad-hoc committee's efforts and progress
 - James Stone -
 - Steelhead hatchery update
 - Numbers of Hatchery Steelhead kelts returned past few years (American, Feather, Mokelumne) - What happens to them?
 - Mitigation and Enhancement Numbers (Feather and American) - How are they derived?
 - Tom Stokely - Update on Sites Reservoir and CVP Biological Opinion
 - Mike Orcutt - Update on CVP Contract Renewal (tentative pending availability)
 - John McManus - Update on release of hatchery fish at Sausalito

15:30 - 16:00 - Agenda Item #4:

- Confirm Status of CMP Agency Technical Meeting and Planning for CMP Workshops
 - Charlotte Ambrose – NMFS; Ryon Kurth - CDFW
- Review CMP Program funding priorities (CDFW)
- Funding shortfall and expiring/expired FRGP Population Monitoring Grants
 - Implications for ESA Status Reviews (NMFS)

16:00 - Public Comment¹

16:20 - Confirm next meeting – Date/Location(s)

16:30 - Adjourn

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

January 21, 2021 Meeting Notes

Note-Taker: Darren Mierau

CAC Members Present: (10; Vivian Helliwell joined late)

Members Absent: 0

Quorum Established: YES

JCFA Consultant: Tom Weseloh present

CDFW Staff Present: Jonathan Nelson, others, see list of attendees

NMFS staff present; Charlotte Ambrose, others- see list of attendees

Public: None heard from.

*For full attendance, please see the meeting attendance log

NEXT MEETING: Not set yet.

MEMBER	ALTERNATE	Representing	Member/Alternate Present	Votes
Darren Mierau (Chair)	Redgie Collins	Sports Fisheries	YY	YYY
Matt Clifford	Brian Johnson	Sports Fisheries	YY	YYY
Gayland Taylor	John McManus	Sports Fisheries	YY	YYY
James Stone	Mike Coopman	Sports Fisheries	Y	YYY
Mitch Farro, (Vice Chair)		Commercial Fisheries	Y	YYY
Vivian Helliwell		Commercial Fisheries	Y (late)	YYY
John Koeppen		Commercial Fisheries	Y	YYY
OPEN		Commercial Fisheries		
Mike Orcutt	Billy Matilton	Native American	Y	YYY
Ted Grantham	Jeanette Howard	Science/Academia	Y	YYY
Ethan Bell	Tom Stokely	Public	YY	YYY

* Five Members makes a Quorum

AGENDA Synopsis

Welcome, Introductions, and Establish Quorum

Opening Comments by CAC Members and CDFW

Public Comment

Review Previous Action Items

CAC Membership and PRC Nominations

- Request to collaborate with CDFW and CFGC for appointments to CACSST

Steelhead Report Card and Restoration Program Update

- Jonathan Nelson/Ryon Kurth - CDFW

PRC Committee Update

- Matt Clifford

Future CAC Meeting Agenda Items

Agenda Item #1: Briefing on Thiamine Deficiency in Hatchery Salmonids

Agenda Item #2: Update on the Klamath Dam Removal Status and Timeline

Agenda Item #3: CACSST Member Round-Robin of Updates

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

Agenda Item #4: Confirm Status of CMP Agency Technical Meeting; Planning for CMP Workshops;

ACTION ITEMS FROM 01.21.2021 Meeting:

Motion 1: Gayland Taylor recommends that CAC adopts a resolution to support reauthorization of the Steelhead Report and Restoration Card program, through a legislative action; Matt Clifford seconded; The motion passed unanimously. CalTrout and TU will look into it.

Motion 2: Mitch Farro recommends a motion to send letter to Director Bonham to encourage him to consider returning back to the previous CVP Operations Biological Opinion; John McManus seconds; Motion passed unanimously. Tom S and John M will work together to write letter for CAC to send to CDFW.

Motion 3: Matt Clifford recommends a motion to have CAC Chair write letter supporting TU Legislation clarifying private landowner liabilities in restoration project implementation; Mitch seconds, on condition that the Committee will review letter along with proposed legislation before it's sent;

Motion passed unanimously; Matt will assist Darren in preparing a letter to send to CAC for review, then likely to Senator McGuire.

Action Items:

- Mitch Farro and John Koeppen will draft a letter for regarding the Whiting Fleet for CAC consideration at our next meeting;
- Tom Stokely will draft a letter for the CAC to sign off on and send to Director Bonham and to Joint Committee; contents of letter will include:
 - supporting state board in their letter response to Reclamation;
 - encourage compliance with Water Code Section 1435 regarding unreasonable impacts to fish and wildlife and not just listed species;
 - encourage Director Bonham to request to State Board to hold hearing on effects of Sacramento temperature operations on Trinity River;
- Mike Orcutt has a tribal member available for the Forestry seat on the PRC; Matt will reach out to Mike to facilitate that consideration;
- Darren is appointing James Stone and Ethan Bell to the Steelhead Subcommittee; Gayland will add these two members to Steelhead Committee correspondences;
- Matt will work with Darren to find ways to get the PRC agenda and meeting notices out to broader distribution;
- NOAA should consider a grant to CDFW for funding to support research and lab analysis related to the Thiamine Deficiency issue;
- James Stone requests a presentation on the Thiamine Deficiency issue at PFMC meeting in March;
- Jon Nelson will send Darren Joe and Brian's Klamath slides
- CDFW will likely submit a BCP regarding Klamath Dam Removal Science Program Funding, and CAC could eventually support this;
- Kevin Shaffer will distribute a list of CA WAP Watersheds, including those for expanded program consideration (if available);
- Jon Nelson has made some information on returns to hatchery, disposition of kelts returning to hatchery, and mitigation numbers available; Darren to circulate;

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

- Kevin Shaffer will be addressing the Lagunitas TAC in Feb;
- Regarding CMP Implementation, the fundamental problem persists - Dept needs a program with funding to grant and contract out for this work; CAC needs to find ways to support this;

Congratulations to Kevin Shaffer and Phil Bairrington on forthcoming retirements!

NOTES TO CAC:

**MAKE SURE YOU FIND THE BEST CONNECTIONS TO THE MEETING THAT YOU CAN
PUT YOUR TEAMS ON MUTE IF NOT TALKING**

Welcome, Introductions, and Establish Quorum

Opening Comments by CAC Members and CDFW

Public Comment

Review Previous Action Items

Letters from John and Tom still forthcoming;

Other Action Items completed;

CAC Membership and PRC Nominations

- **Request to collaborate with CDFW and CFGC for appointments to CACSST**

Mike Orcutt has a tribal member available for the Forestry seat on the PRC; Matt will reach out to Mike to facilitate that consideration; Mike reminds us that the Hoopa Tribe is the largest timber landowner in the Klamath Basin (and North Coast?);

Mitch pointed out that the CAC does not nominate the Forestry position;

Steelhead Report Card and Restoration Program Update

- **Jonathan Nelson/Ryon Kurth - CDFW; Gayland Taylor SC Chair**

Gayland reports that we hosted a Steelhead Committee meeting; CDFW announced they'll have more flexibility than previously understood for how to use the steelhead funds; Department proposing and developing cost estimates for use of steelhead funds for creel surveys; Steelhead Committee was/is in favor of this; there may be funds left over (from annual balance) for use for other restoration projects and other steelhead-related actions;

Darren asked if we have room for other steelhead committee members? Yes, typically 4 members including the CAC Chair (defacto), and given this is a standing committee of the CAC, the chair can appoint members;

Mitch says chair has authority to appoint members;

Jon reminded us that James Stone would like to join committee; James is still interested...

Darren asked if Ethan Bell is interested in participating in the Committee; he expressed interest.

Darren therefore is appointing James Stone and Ethan Bell to the Steelhead Subcommittee;

Tom W; did the committee discuss the re-authorization for the steelhead card? Jon - we discussed it but don't have a plan yet; Tom expressing urgency to do the reauthorization (needed in a couple of weeks);

Jon not familiar with how to do the reauthorization

Matt asking if he and Redgie could take this up. Yes, CalTrout and TU will look into it.

Tom has good description and understanding of the procedure

Mitch - in the past the sportfishing reps have taken lead in reauthorization;

Gayland - should we take a vote to reauthorize now? Jon - yes we need to do that now?

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

Motion 1: Gayland Taylor recommends that CAC adopts a resolution to support reauthorization of the Steelhead Report and Restoration Card program, through a legislative action; Matt Clifford seconded; The motion passed unanimously. CalTrout and TU will look into it.

PRC Committee Update

○ **Matt Clifford**

Matt - PRC is hosting shorter and more frequently given virtual meetings during COVID; PRC is following new procedure introduced by Sandy J with briefings from PRC members (topics); focus tables (priorities)...fairly extensive overhaul of that process between CDFW and NMFS. PRC is trying to get the word out about that;

FRGP removed “enforcement” project type

Discussed scoring of multi-benefit projects

Getting annual meeting on calendar for February to review scores from previous grant round;

PRC agendas are posted at the CDFW notices webpage;

Matt will work with Darren to find ways to get the PRC agenda and meeting notices out to broader distribution;

Future CAC Meeting Agenda Items

Matt - 6ppd issue

Ted - updates on drought planning and responses

Redgie - CalTrout is looking at listing for SO Cal Steelhead for CESA listing

Darren - Mendo Coast supplementation with NMFS and TNC

Dan Kratville - recommends we couch 6ppd as water contaminants and not just one item

Mitch - CDFW Salmon Habitat programs Prop-1 and 68 updates; (Darren - perhaps make this a gap analysis; what is the department doing overall, and what isn't getting done that the CAC could recommend and pursue [e.g., strategic planning, science framework, monitoring])

Jon - provided a reminder to the CAC that request for department updates to the Committee requires participation from CDFW, staff time, etc.; Jon recommends that the CAC focus on agenda items that will lead to CAC Actions and Recommendations; not just an “update”;

seek to have objective for meeting agendas

Matt C responding and clarifying his suggestion re 6ppd;

CAC should check in with Department to determine if staff and relevant information are available;

Gayland asking about how the fire funding is being coordinated with fisheries interests; Jon response.

Agenda Item #1: Briefing on Thiamine Deficiency in Hatchery Salmonids

Introduce Rachel Johnson from NOAA Fisheries;

Rachel Johnson is a Research Fisheries Biologist and lead of the Salmon Life History Team with NOAA Fisheries, Fisheries Ecology Division specializing in applied ecology of freshwater, anadromous and marine fishes; BA Wellesely College; PhD UC Santa Cruz

She maintains an affiliated faculty position at the University of California Davis in the Center for Watershed Science.

And Rachel describes herself as a translational ecologist dedicated to communicating and synthesizing science to ensure that scientific information is available to resource managers, decision-makers, and the public.

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

See presentation materials.

Note list of Rachel's colleagues who have participated in the research and presentation;

This is super relevant and needs additional research follow up

John Koeppen - was able to provide samples to the researchers; inviting Rachel and her team to participate in and present at the SAS meeting (Salmon Advisory Subpanel);

Rachel - NOAA is preparing a grant for funding for more collections; is willing and available to participate in the meeting; can scale presentation;

Kevin Shaffer - NOAA should consider a grant to CDFW; pathology lab is stretched thin, ability to respond to these crises long-term is thin. Kevin suggesting the two fisheries agencies need to discuss and address the wild fisheries implications; this is Pacific Ocean issue and is a Council discussion that should occur; all States should be supportive; would like to make commitment, could be feasible; where does this fall in triage;

Wade Sinnen - was the experiment extended to coho or steelhead? can thiamine augmentation lead to OD? What do we think the effect might be on other ocean fisheries who eat the anchovies;

T. Williams on coastal science did a CA wide collection, data not available yet, but is being looked at

Dale says fish can't OD on thiamine;

What about tuna? could be at risk if they're feeding on same thiamine deficient prey;

Mammals beaching, because losing equilibrium?

Aligators in Florida;

Jay Rowan - does NOAA have length of effect from injections? Rachel - hasn't been looked at but they have the data; Dale - fish have a propensity to hold on to thiamine;

Brett Kormos - in future data collection, align analysis by stocks; productivity (or loss) is not just for ESA stocks, but target stocks; [I did not capture these comments adequately]

James Stone - eye opening info presented; James guides up on Sac and Trinity;

1. would like to see presentation at PFMC in March
2. Q: CV was hardest hit, did you compare rivers within CV to see which were hardest hit?
 - a. Rachel - they do have stock and tributary data, but biggest effect is at scale of runs
3. are we getting data on wild fish?
 - a. Rachel - likely that wild fish are being affected.

Mitch Farro - this is stunning presentation; Mike Maas collected stomach samples from fisheries in the '80s; there may be write-up at Bodega Bay Marine Lab, if historical data are needed;

Mike Orcutt - missed summary of Klamath and Trinity, but wanted to clarify that they weren't deficient; why weren't FRC sampled at TRH?

Rachel - they do have data but the funding was delta science so somewhat of a biased focus on CV ; will be getting there with upcoming analysis;

How would Trinity Program get updated on research information? Link to Tommy Williams.

Wade - clarifying that a question is 'what effect the thiamine deficiency has on adults'?

Dale- may have an effect but ...[didn't catch the response]

Tom W pointing out there's a line item in the Gov budget for fisheries[need to fill in]

Send letter to Senator McGuire, cc budget subcommittee and budget committee chairs.

Agenda Item #2: Update on the Klamath Dam Removal Status and Timeline

[Jon send Darren Joe and Brian's slides]

Klamath \$400 mil plus contingency; at 90% design stage now;

Brian describing the negotiations that lead to the final agreement MOU to implement; Plan is now better than was before, everyone is in, PacifiCorp is fast-tracking preparations;

April 2022 for license surrender and approval of decommissioning plan

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

Joe

Darren - is the CESA/LSA Permitting MOU available to the public, and can this be considered a viable template for other programs?

- still a work in progress, so not ready to serve as a template; could possibly serve for PVP
- FERC "good neighbor" policy to work out issues before coming

Mike Orcutt - clarifying which tribes signed the agreement(s); also noting that Dept of Interior didn't sign the agreement; on NEPA timeframe, does this include the geographic scope below Keno?

[didn't catch response]

Contracts with Kewitt and RES signed and being refined

Gayland - looking for opportunities for public relations linkage of the Steelhead Report Card funds; on the order of 10's of thousands available; Brian likes the idea;

Ted - how to mobilize the scientific community around dam removal, for pre-project and post-project monitoring; Brian: quite a bit going on but likely not enough; folks on Fed gov side have been a bit restrained in previous years, and hasn't had enough involvement;

Wade - HSU's studies on habitat, genetics, SR reintroduction; need a re-dedication to sci and monitoring; there is ongoing work;

What action can CAC help with ?

Make mental note that summer 2021, there will be round of comments; indiv orgs and CAC could potentially weigh in;

Discussion re science and monitoring recommendations to the State

Wade - CDFW will likely submit a BCP regarding Klamath Dam Removal Science Program Funding and CAC could help.

Agenda Item #3: CACSST Member Round-Robin of Updates

Ted Grantham: CA Environmental Flows Framework.

Jeanette Howard: update on SFER CA WAP

Kevin Shaffer - providing context regarding inter-agency effort (CDFW+SWRCB) to take watershed approach; didn't identify a 6th location in SJR Basin, but with possibility of drought this might be expanding; Kevin will distribute a list of CA WAP Watersheds; also didn't identify an arid (desert) focal watershed;

will likely be an effort to refocus on the five watersheds; "Permanent Commitments".

Vivian - will this apply to water users other than cannabis? KS- yes

John Koeppen -

whiting mothership

Coho workgroup convened Hoopa and NMFS to manage SONCC in Trinity;

James Stone -

Jon Nelson has provided updates from the Department on returns to hatchery, disposition of kelts returning to hatchery, and mitigation numbers. Jon Nelson has made some information available; Darren will circulate.

Jon - trying to get to the goals of 2000 fish (in river + hatchery) in FRH; Jon clarifying that info he's provided are only hatchery counts and do not include river counts/estimates.

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

Jon - The Dept has space limitations in current infrastructure for hatcheries, especially for programs that are raising multiple salmonid species

Kevin - Scientific Report to Congress in 2012. science, aquaculture and health is and has been restrained by infrastructure; trout hatcheries in similar status; in most instances there's a federal partner; improving hatcheries is a state issue. State isn't going to provide capital outlay;

Tom Stokely

CVP Biological Opinion

Regarding exports from the Delta; ongoing litigation, may be settled given there's a new administration and new Interior leadership; could send note to Director to rescind new Biol Op.

Sites - program managers are reaching out to give presentations to stakeholders; project has been downsized, reduced cost; using funds from Prop-1 (\$850 mil) but CDFW opposed Bond funding for?? ; Salmon component has been eliminated, Water Commission approved, but Tom suggests this needs to be reconsidered.

Sites Reservoir

Sites is issuing a new draft EIS/EIR and new Water Right application this summer;

Also need to pay attention to the ITP.

Tom not convinced this is a beneficial project; still proposing minimum bypass below the CDFW recommended level;

Changing location of discharge to the delta (through Colusa drain);

Trinity still an issue; how will Trinity flows be protected;

Who will own water right;

Sites Managers proposing workshops on issues;

Tom - lots of unanswered questions;

John McManus following up on Tom's recommendation that CACSST send letter to Director Bonham; CDFW currently supports current CVP BiOp, so we may not get Director's support on that.

Mitch - is there something CAC could do?

Tom -we could write to director to encourage him to consider returning back to 2009 CVP Biol Op.

Motion 2: Mitch Farro recommends a motion to send letter to Director Bonham to encourage him to consider returning back to the previous CVP Operations Biological Opinion; John McManus seconds; Motion passed unanimously. Tom S and John M will work together to write letter for Chairman to send to CDFW.

John McM - if Sites drains to Colusa will that cause problems with fish migration?

Matt Clifford

TU Legislation clarifying that landowners do not take on legal liability for restoration actions that take place on their property; engineers should take on liability related to design, they carry insurance; will be covered, and not likely the landowner would be responsible. TU Bill would clarify this;

Bill would enable the State to step in

Motion 3: Matt Clifford recommends a motion to have CAC Chair write letter ; Mitch seconds on condition that the Committee will review letter along with proposed legislation before it's sent; Motion passes unanimously; Matt will assist Darren in preparing a letter to send to CAC for review, then likely to Senator McGuire.

Mike Orcutt

CVP Contract Renewals: Issue is subject to ongoing Litigation introduced in August 26 2020, hearing on Jan 10th ;

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

Dismissal of case and change of venue; hopeful the Court would keep in Northern but did not happen and will shift to Eastern District Court;

Broader issue is CVP Water allocations and how pertains to Trinity River

Deep issues here related to USBR Dept of Interior, etc. Beyond the purview of the CAC.

John McMannus

Issue of release location of hatchery smolts; letter was drafted in 2018 and not sent;

comments from Gordon at Lagunitas Creek program (Public Member);

KShaffer -this is the type of interaction the Director would like to see, collaboration between partners and programs; would like to see the data from Lagunitas genetics; don't think the CEQA doc is greatly flawed, could be better in the future, have done what they need to do at present.

Communities sitting down together would be a good outcome; KShaffer will be addressing the Lagunitas TAC in Feb. CEQA doc is a Programmatic.

Agenda Item #4: Confirm Status of CMP Agency Technical Meeting; Planning for CMP Workshops;

Jeff Jahn

NMFS SWFSC working with CDFW to develop technical workshops on CMP focusing on lessons learned; identify updates., what's working, how to make the program more efficient and adaptive

Developing a series of 4-5 workshops tentatively scheduled for May 2021

Charlotte Ambrose

Implications of losses of CMP programs to the NMFS CMP data for status reviews for salmonids;

Now have 4 generations of data for numerous programs and populations; loss of these programs has serious implications for status reviews;

Navarro

Garcia

St Cruz Mts

Lagunitas

HB Tribs

Mendo Tribs

long term data sets

Charlotte acknowledges the tough funding decisions CDFW has to make;

Kevin - haven't sat down with recovery units about 5 year reviews; has been talking to the CAC since 2005 about funding shortfalls, with no immediate solution on the horizon.

Russian River may also go offline; currently putting \$900k into RR and CDFW won't have that kind of funds to reallocate;

Regarding CMP Implementation, The fundamental problem persists - Dept needs a program with funding to grant and contract out for this work;

Dept very concerned about So Cal Steelhead;

The most CDFW has ever spent in a year (on CMP?) is about \$7mil; much less now and most comes from PCSRF;

Public Comments

Michael Reichmuth - NPS funding for Lagunitas ending; taking a big hit; hard to plan ahead with funding uncertainty;

California Advisory Committee on Salmon and Steelhead Trout

Kevin announcing he's RETIRING in April

Phil Bairrington also retiring possible Fall 2021

Phil – Mad River Hatchery Steelhead HGMP finished in 2017 still needs funding for monitoring as required in the plan.

John McManus offering fishing trip to Kevin Shaffer. “Juuuust sit right back and you'll hear a tale, a tale of a fateful trip....”

NOTES TO CAC:

**MAKE SURE YOU FIND THE BEST CONNECTION TO THE MEETING THAT YOU CAN
PUT YOUR TEAMS ON MUTE IF NOT TALKING**

CAC Next Meeting Dates

April ??, 2021 Virtual Meeting

Bay-Delta Conference April 6-9

SRF April 21-23

PFMC April 5-9

Let's consider April 15 or April 29, and May 6 and 13 for our next meeting date.